



REPORT ON NATIONAL AND EUROPEAN MEASURES ADDRESSING VULNERABLE CONSUMERS AND ENERGY POVERTY



This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 754051

Copyright message

This document contains original unpublished work except where clearly indicated otherwise. Acknowledgement of previously published material and of the work of others has been made through appropriate citation, quotation or both. Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

Disclaimer Any dissemination of results reflects only the author's view and the European Commission is not responsible for any use that may be made of the information it contains.

Table of Contents

1	Presentation of Assist Project	6
1.1	ASSIST overview and introduction	6
1.2	Work Package 2 – In depth knowledge on Consumers Vulnerability / Energy Poverty ..	6
1.3	Scope of Review	7
2	A summary of the national and European measures addressing vulnerable consumers and energy poverty	8
2.1	Methodology	8
2.1.1	Methodology for context data collection.....	8
2.1.2	Methodology for EU project analysis	9
3	Summary of National Measures	12
3.1	How have different Member States defined issues of energy poverty and vulnerable consumers?.....	12
3.2	What different measures have Member States put in place to address the issues of energy poverty and vulnerable consumers?	16
3.2.1	Financial interventions.....	17
3.2.2	Additional consumer protection	18
3.2.3	Energy efficiency.....	18
3.2.4	Information provision & raising awareness	19
3.3	What are the similarities/differences across Member States with respect to recognition and definition of the issue, and policy measures implemented to address the issue?	22
4	Summary of selected EU projects	24
4.1	The focus on vulnerable consumers and energy poverty - the way vulnerable consumers and energy poverty are addressed;.....	24
4.1.1	With regard of identification several approaches could be delineated:.....	24
4.1.2	The different approaches outlined above reflect the different focus of the undertaken actions:.....	25
4.1.3	Trainings for energy information and advising – a review of the focus and approach	26
4.1.4	Established networks – a review of the focus and stakeholders	27
4.1.5	Enhancing energy saving behavioural change & strategies to involve consumers' engagement – types of actions and strategies;	27
4.1.6	Typologies of policy proposals for a better protection of vulnerable consumers & against energy poverty - types of areas and focus of policy proposals;	28
4.1.7	Summary.....	29
5	Annex 1 - Database on Reviewed EU Projects	30

5.1	Action Projects	30
5.2	Research Projects.....	34
5.3	Mixed/Other Projects	37
6	Annex 2 - Partner Countries: Research Questionnaire Template	40
7	Annex 3 - Wider European Countries: Research Questionnaire Template	50

1 Presentation of Assist Project

1.1 ASSIST overview and introduction

ASSIST is a 36-month European ‘market activation and policy orientation’ project that seeks to tackle energy poverty and support vulnerable consumers. It intends to both actively engage consumers in the energy market and positively change behaviour in relation to energy consumption as well as influence energy poverty policy.

Based on the conclusion of the Energy Citizens’ Forum and of the European Vulnerable Consumers Working Group, the project intends to combine activities addressing both energy and social dimensions as energy poverty is not only an energy issue nor can it be tackled in isolation of the bigger issue of poverty. More specifically, ASSIST strategic objectives are to contribute to:

- tackle energy poverty;

- reduce the main barriers of the energy market faced by vulnerable consumers;

- support vulnerable consumers to be more efficient with their domestic energy consumption (electricity and gas).

To fulfil its goals, the project foresees diversified and correlated research, networking and in-field actions, consistent with the relevant national and European scenarios. Among them, ASSIST intends to create a network of innovative professional figures supporting vulnerable consumers in their domestic energy consumption: “**Home Energy Advisor (HEA)**”.

1.2 Work Package 2 – In depth knowledge on Consumers Vulnerability / Energy Poverty

This report is one of a series of reports produced as part of Work Package 2 of the ASSIST Project. The objective of this work package is to both gain a more in-depth understanding of vulnerable consumers and energy poverty as a problem in European society and of the possible solutions to tackle it.

The statistical data gathering, analysis and survey work that form the basis of this work package will allow for fine-tuning of the activities foreseen in the forthcoming work packages (mainly WP5 - ASSIST action). This data will also be used for the production of a “Vulnerable Consumers and Energy Poverty Report” which will effectively be a summary of the 4 reports in this series. It is anticipated that this report will represent an up-date to

SeRENADE¹ on the social phenomena of consumers vulnerability and more specifically of energy poverty and advice. It will assess how European Member States

- define the issue of energy poverty and vulnerable consumers;
- implement measures to address these issues; and
- address household energy needs and target energy efficiency measures to low-income households living in energy inefficient houses.

The analysis of the data gathered will guide the recommendations to be made by the ASSIST project for European policy changes, one that involves developing sound and efficient European policies that are also robust and effective in terms of market design. This work package will undertake a thorough analysis and mapping of consumer vulnerability and energy poverty in Europe, integrating the following aspects:

- Context of energy poverty across Europe and the governance of the actors (who does what and how);
- Database of existing financial measures put in place in all Member States to support vulnerable consumers and alleviate / tackle energy poverty,
- Database of public initiatives carried out and on-going to tackle the problem;
- Good practices identified that can be shared across Member States;
- National market survey on vulnerable consumers / energy poverty to better understand vulnerable consumer's energy consumption, habits, knowledge and awareness on energy efficiency.

1.3 Scope of Review

In carrying out the literature review that has been the background to this report and in the discussions that have taken place with individuals from across all member states, there are two interchangeable terms most commonly used to describe the issue we are addressing, 'energy poverty' and 'energy poverty'. Thomson (2014b) found that the majority of official EU documents discussing the issue used the term energy poverty - "a situation where individuals or households are not able to adequately heat or provide other required energy services in their homes at affordable cost" Insight E report. In view of its

¹ The SeRENADE project (2006-2008) brought together several experienced advice providers to: Study and review existing advice provision in Europe; Make know-how on delivering advice easily available through an online energy advice toolkit and forum for exchange of knowledge and experience between skilled practitioners and new providers; Deliver a pro-active dissemination programme to promote the benefits of advice and the resources available. In terms of advice subject matter, the project is concerned with energy efficiency, renewable energy and sustainable transportation/mobility. Three client groups are considered: households, small and medium enterprises and local authorities.

widespread use, this report and the ASSIST2gether Consortium, will also use the term 'energy poverty'.

In 2007 the European Commission Intelligent Energy Europe programme funded the SeRENADE project, an initiative that looked at the provision of energy advice across Europe. The final report identified 20 significant advice programs across Europe aimed at households. That work is now already 10 years old and during that time there have been many changes across Europe both politically and economically that will have had an impact on both the experience of energy poverty and approaches to it.

The purpose of this section is to carry out a mapping exercise on the progress that has been made, and the current state of play to address energy poverty since the SeRENADE report was published. Focusing on support and advice, we will be examining whether the programmes from 10 years ago are still running or have they been replaced and if so why and with what. This report will include an analysis of consumer vulnerability in terms of energy poverty in each European country, the governance and the actors involved – who does what and how? It will provide an overview for policy makers of the situation across Europe and between member states, both in terms of how energy poverty is perceived as a problem and what measures are being taken to address it.

2 A summary of the national and European measures addressing vulnerable consumers and energy poverty

The approach to energy poverty across European Member States, varies widely. Whilst some countries recognize it as a significant issue, for others it is not especially prevalent or is so intertwined with other problems, often associated with wider poverty issues that addressing it gets lost.

Whilst a one size fits all approach would ultimately not work for all European Member States, the recommendation is that it would be beneficial to have a universal definition but one that is wider than just energy poverty to cover vulnerability more generally.

2.1 Methodology

2.1.1 Methodology for context data collection

- In order to carry out this mapping exercise a number of activities were undertaken:

- A desk-based literature review of European Commission funded energy poverty initiatives, in particular H2020 and IEE, carried out in the 10 years since the Serenade report in 2007. (Full list can be found in Annex 1)
- Following the desk based review, questionnaires were developed and circulated amongst the ASSIST partners for completion (Annex 2). The purpose of these questionnaires was to update our understanding of circumstances surrounding energy poverty in these specific nations since the Serenade report, adding depth and/or clarification to specific areas of interest.
- To ensure complete European representation, partners used their wider international networks to circulate a questionnaire that whilst less detailed than the one they had completed, provided the information needed to ensure this report would reflect on the situation throughout Europe. (Annex 3)

It should perhaps be noted that whilst questionnaires are able to provide a very useful snapshot as to how energy poverty is viewed in each country and the efforts in place to address it, they do have their limitations. Notably that they are the views of a small number of people, sometimes just one person from one organisation. Whilst steps were taken to ensure that the interviewee would have the knowledge needed to complete the questionnaire, in those countries where energy poverty is still a relatively new concept, this might not always have been the case. Some interviewees and indeed a number of schemes to address energy poverty are carried out at the local or regional level and therefore, keeping track of them all, certainly if the interviewees themselves were local, could potentially provide a gap in knowledge. Nevertheless, they do most certainly provide a flavour of what work is taking place on the ground in that country.

Of the 28 European countries, questionnaires were completed by 27 with only Latvia outstanding for the lack of being able to locate the correct organization to approach. The depth of responses varied widely; some were immensely detailed whilst others provided mainly yes and no answers. On the whole, the depth of response appeared to reflect that country's engagement on the issue, indicating that for one reason or another, energy poverty was not specifically on their radar.

2.1.2 Methodology for EU project analysis

Desk-based research of EU projects was carried out to provide partners with a basis for activities and recommendations. For this purpose different sources were used².

² The following sources were used: a) <http://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/> - EC Intelligent Energy Europe – the web page includes more than 800 projects; <https://ec.europa.eu/easme/en/news/energy-efficiency-projects-tackle-energy-poverty-support-most-vulnerable-consumers> - Website of the EASME with some on energy poverty projects included; The list of the projects invited for the Contractors meeting Consumer Engagement for Sustainable Energy 3-4 April 2017; Research projects and Publications on energy poverty

The criteria for selection were:

- Projects that included at least 2 EU member-states;
- Projects that targeted household/family energy consumption. As a rule projects that addressed energy efficiency of buildings were excluded – exceptions could be made if project's activities included other actions of interest to the ASSIST project;
- Projects that prioritise, in some way, energy poverty and/or vulnerable consumers;
- Projects that are linked to ASSIST activities and envisaged outputs (research in the field, establishing Home Energy Advisor training, Home Energy Advisor networking, energy services for vulnerable consumers/energy poor, energy saving due to behavioural change, policy proposals with reference to energy poverty/vulnerable consumers and identified opportunities for a better protection of vulnerable consumers);
- Most of the projects were recent, but older projects that were relevant to the ASSIST project were included as well. On-going projects were also included if they had already produced some results that could be useful to ASSIST;
- Projects that could have 'good practices' recommendations or suggestions;
- Important publications in the field of ASSIST are regarded as projects.

As a result 30 projects (see Annex 1) were selected. Although not representative, the sample provides an idea of the state, main directions and activities regarding energy poverty and vulnerable consumers within EU projects. The EU projects reviewed could be classified as follows:

1. With regard to the basic focus of the action the projects could be divided basically into action projects and research projects.

- Action projects as a rule are engaged with different activities and target groups, including vulnerable consumers and energy poverty. They aim to produce some clear outputs and concrete results and they invest in different types of activities linked directly or indirectly with consumers; often they are focused on some behaviour change leading to energy savings. Research is usually included in these projects but it is clearly secondary to the basic focus of activities.
- Research projects that review and analyse the state of play in connection with energy poverty and vulnerable consumers.
- A few of the projects do not fit clearly into this typology as their basic focus is research linked to some concrete activities (for example, accreditation system for professional trainings)

2. By geographical coverage the projects could be divided into 2 categories as well:

Six of the reviewed projects, especially research projects, were EU wide, providing comparative data on energy poverty and vulnerable consumers and sometimes actions in all the member states.

The remaining 24 projects, most of which were action projects, involved a different numbers of countries (anywhere between 2 and 16). In some of these projects data for all the EU countries is presented. Still their activities as a rule are implemented mainly in the partner countries of the respective project (see Annex 2, including partner countries in the reviewed projects). It is noteworthy that some Member States are very rarely represented or not represented at all among the partners in the projects under consideration.

3. Timeline – 26 of the reviewed projects are completed. They all have been implemented within the last decade. The earliest start of a reviewed project is 2006. The other 4 projects have started but are not completed (EPOV, Smart-up, Step by Step, Citizens Forum).

4. In 13 of the reviewed 30 projects at least one (sometimes two) partner(s) in ASSIST project have been engaged. This provides a good basis to exchange and upgrade on previous activities.

3 Summary of National Measures

3.1 How have different Member States defined issues of energy poverty and vulnerable consumers?

One of the key aims of the ASSIST project is to train a European network of Home Energy Advisors (HEA) whose role will be to provide energy advice to vulnerable households within their own country. In order to do this, it is essential to understand how Member States identify and support vulnerable consumers and how they alleviate and/or tackle energy poverty.

The questionnaires described above and found in Annex 2 & 3 asked the following:

- In reference to the list of energy poverty definitions (Annex 1 Appendix 1), is there a definition for the country concerned?
- Do you use the welfare system as a way to actively identify (not define) vulnerable consumers?

Country	Is there a formal definition of energy poverty?	How are Vulnerable consumers identified?
Austria	No though there is an informal definition which is widely used “Energy poverty affected: are households which have an income below the poverty threshold and at the same time have high energy costs above-average”	The welfare system
Belgium	<p>The following definitions (based on three different indicators) are used for official reporting on energy poverty in Belgium:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The ‘measured energy poverty’ indicator: based on the Boardman approach (used in the UK to define fuel poverty). Each year, the median value of the ratio between energy expenditures and equivalent household income (corrected for the household size) is calculated. A ‘boundary value’ is defined as twice the value of the median value. If a household spends more on energy than indicated by the boundary value (in %), this household is considered as an ‘energy poor’ household in an objective sense.• The ‘hidden energy poverty’ indicator: concerns the fraction of the Belgian households that is reducing	<p>Vulnerable consumers can be entitled to certain benefits that help them in paying their energy bills. Depending on the exact nature of the benefit (e.g. access to a social energy tariff, free energy scan, social renting tariffs for energy-saving, etc.) different welfare system parameters are used to specify the eligible customers.</p>

	<p>their energy use to the extent that it might have a negative impact on living conditions and quality of life in general. The hidden energy poverty indicator is calculated based on the comparison of a household's energy expenditures with the average energy expenditure of a comparable household (with the same number of inhabitants) living in a comparable dwelling (with the same number of rooms). If a household spends less than half of the average of a comparable household living in a comparable dwelling, and if this household belongs to the 50% of households with the lowest equivalent incomes in Belgium, this household is considered to be in a situation of hidden energy poverty.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 'subjective energy poverty' indicator: is based on the percentage of households that report having difficulties to adequately heat their dwelling. 	
Bulgaria	No	The welfare system provides heating benefit for those households where their monthly income in the last 6 months is lower or equal to the differentiated minimum income. (Insight E Report)
Croatia	No	Vulnerable consumers are those recipients of social welfare or those with disabilities, who are eligible for a monthly deduction in their electricity bills of about 26 Euros per month independently of the amount of their bills.
Cyprus	<p>Yes</p> <p>Energy poverty may relate to the situation of customers who may be in a difficult position because of their low income as indicated by their tax statements in conjunction with their professional status, marital status and specific health conditions and therefore, are unable to respond to the costs for the reasonable needs of the supply of electricity, as these costs represent a significant proportion of their disposable income.</p>	Welfare system.
Czech Republic	No	Through the welfare system - households, who spend 30% (35%

		for Prague) of total income on housing costs are entitled to state housing benefits.
Denmark	No	Welfare system
Estonia	No	Energy poverty is not identified as an issue separate to poverty more generally. Through the Social Welfare Act a person living alone or a family whose monthly net income, after the deduction of housing expenses, is below the subsistence level has the right to receive a subsistence benefit.
Finland	No official definition of energy poverty but the Ministry of Environment has defined energy poverty in their study as follows: Energy poverty refers to the difficulty of maintaining or satisfying the basic needs due to energy costs. This means difficulty or inability of maintaining an appropriate temperature in the apartment (separate houses) or difficulty of paying for other essential energy-related services (e.g. household electricity, hot water use). They also include transport energy when it is of necessity. Finland is a sparsely populated country, where the basic services can be at a distance of tens of kilometres. The car can be a necessary for maintaining livelihood and social relations.	There is no official definition of vulnerable consumers that includes reference to energy/energy poverty. The Ministry of Environment has defined people at being risk of Energy Poverty as households with small income and large non-energy efficient housing.
France	No	Welfare system
Germany	No	Welfare system.
Greece	Yes Law 4001/2011 defines the criteria, conditions and procedure for integration of customers into the vulnerable customer registry. These customers are defined by having low income, families with three children or more, long-term unemployed, disabled people, people on life support, as well as elderly people based on specific income criteria	No formal procedure, tends to rely on self-identification to access support programmes or initiatives.
Hungary	No	The social welfare system identifies vulnerable consumers. An appropriate body certifies their vulnerable consumer status eligibility which they will need when dealing with their energy provider.
Ireland	Yes Spends more than 10% of its disposable income on energy services in the home.	Welfare system.
Italy	No An informal definition provided by the	Primarily through the welfare system and the SIA initiative – an

	<p>Authority for Italy....</p> <p>A family is vulnerable when more than 5% of income is spent for electricity and 10% for gas.</p>	<p>organised programme to help households address the reasons behind their state of poverty. Other financial indicators are also used.</p>
Latvia	No data available	No data available
Lithuania	No	Welfare system.
Luxembourg	<p>No</p> <p>Whilst there is no formal definition, The Luxembourgish institute for socio-economic research (LISER) defines energy poverty on the household level by the fact that they do not have enough money to heat their homes or that they were not able to pay their electricity, gas, water and heating bills with their own financial resources during the last 12 months.</p>	Welfare system.
Malta	No	The welfare system – low energy benefit system for low income families.
Netherlands	No	At the municipality level, social organisations working on debt mediation have a network for sharing information. Households with debts in several domains can be contacted by municipal energy advisors to offer free advice on how to pay the energy bill.
Poland	<p>There is no definition and trivial way to identify a vulnerable consumer to energy. Vulnerable consumer is the person entitled to the housing allowance from social welfare system, but not everyone is vulnerable to energy. Fulfilment of this condition gives consumer possibility to apply for energy supplement."</p>	Welfare system. Vulnerable consumers can get household benefit based on a series of low income criteria. However, regional local government can give additional subsidies based on their own criteria.
Portugal	No	Response uncertain
Romania	<p>Yes</p> <p>Energy poverty: when it is impossible for a person or household to meet their minimum energy needs: lighting, optimal heating of the home during winter, support of cooking facilities and hot water supply in the dwelling, but also the use of means of communications that require energy</p>	Welfare system
Slovakia	<p>Yes</p> <p>Energy poverty is defined as a condition when average monthly household expenditures for the consumption of electricity, gas and heat, represent a significant share of the average monthly household income.</p>	No formal process for identifying a vulnerable consumer.

Slovenia	Formal definition currently being developed	The welfare system currently uses financial measures to identify those households at risk of energy poverty. Looking at those living below the poverty line; who are the recipients of social or financial support and those who, are disconnected from their energy supply.
Spain	No	There is a definition for vulnerable consumer that includes a reference to energy. The welfare system identifies vulnerable consumers and increasingly, GP practices.
Sweden	No	Response uncertain
UK	Yes A household to be energy poor if 1. their income is below the poverty line (taking into account energy costs); and 2) their energy costs are higher than is typical for their household type (DECC 2013).	The welfare system looks at age and health conditions of household members as well as their income. A energy poverty assessment is carried out (Low Income High Cost) which also looks at the SAP score of the property.

Interestingly the majority of Member States do not have a formal definition of energy poverty though this does not appear to preclude them from necessarily addressing it as an issue and identifying measures to help vulnerable consumers. A number of respondents to the questionnaires said that whilst there might not be a national definition for their country, there might be an informal one or they would use the World Health Organisation definition *‘Fuel poverty is defined as having to spend 10% or more of a household’s net income to heat their home to an adequate standard of warmth’*

In terms of vulnerable consumers, each country’s welfare system, perhaps not surprisingly, appears to be the primary method of identifying those households who in energy poverty or at risk of it but in the majority of cases it is consumed within the wider bracket of vulnerability and poverty which looks at a whole host of other indicators.

3.2 What different measures have Member States put in place to address the issues of energy poverty and vulnerable consumers?

The risk to households of energy poverty will be a function of five factors ³. As a result of the research carried for this project, a sixth factor has been added.

- The rate of energy price rises versus income growth
- Ability to access cheaper energy prices
- Household energy needs
- Efficiency of energy use
- Policy interventions
- Reluctance to ask for help

Ultimately, however, the outcomes of energy poverty are the same, where households will forgo energy use, have arrears in energy accounts and forego consumption in other areas, all of which have a chain reaction of consequences eg. Impacts on health⁴

If Member States are to address energy poverty, they need to introduce interventions that take into account the risks listed above.

3.2.1 Financial interventions

Financial interventions are a fundamental instrument to support vulnerable consumers since a lack of finance is one of the key factors for all people in energy poverty. Nevertheless, it has a tendency to focus on short-term relief and does not address some of the other fundamental factors involved in energy poverty.

The majority of Member States offer some kind of financial intervention for those who are most vulnerable though it might not necessarily be targeted specifically at paying for the household's energy bill, it might be identified and distributed through a country's social welfare system. In the majority of cases this is done nationally though certainly in some such as France, Poland, Croatia and Romania this may also be through local networks such as municipalities or organisations such as the EnergieBank in the Netherlands.

In some countries, namely the UK, Ireland, Romania and Croatia, there is a more targeted financial intervention with the use of a national winter energy payment scheme where households identified as most at risk of energy poverty are paid a set sum. In Croatia this is 100 Euros in the UK it is 151 Euros.

³ Preston et al, 2014 taken from Insight-E, Energy poverty and vulnerable consumers in the energy sector across the EU: analysis of policies and measures. Steve Pye (UCL), Audrey Dobbins (USTUTT), May 2015

⁴ Grevisse, F. And Bryant, M. (2011) Energy poverty in Europe: Towards a more global understanding. ECEEE 2011 Summer Study

3.2.2 Additional consumer protection

Whilst ultimately it comes down to finance for many households in or at risk of energy poverty, the majority of Member States provide vulnerable consumers with additional consumer protection to protect them from the vagaries of the retail energy markets.

1. Protection against disconnection

In a number of member states there is protection for vulnerable consumers against disconnection, most especially during winter periods (Finland, Spain and Greece) where those who are disconnected due to lack of payment must be reconnected. In Spain this protection is available for the whole year, not only winter period, but only available for extreme vulnerability. In Croatia this protection is extended to all who are on the social welfare register but it might not necessarily help those who have only recently entered into economic hardship, perhaps because they have just lost their job. Some Member States don't seem to offer this at all –Slovakia where a Distribution System Operator is simply obliged to warn if there is going to be a disconnection or interruption to the energy supply. In Belgium there are a number of steps that need to be taken before a household is disconnected, which include the account being taken from a commercial supplier to the DSO and the installation of a budget meter.

2. Social tariff

A number of Member of States have added a layer of protection for vulnerable consumers with the introduction of social tariffs (Cyprus, France, Greece, Spain, Italy and Belgium).

3.2.3 Energy efficiency

For the majority of member states, the problems of energy poverty are intimately linked with that of the energy efficiency and build quality of a vulnerable consumer's home. Inevitably those on low incomes live in rented dwellings of low quality and high bills because this is all they can afford. This problem however, also exists for many Member States where in more rural areas vulnerable consumers are living either in particularly old and poorly maintained properties or where they do not have access to more energy efficient forms of heating. The responses from a number of the questionnaires used to compile this report identified that a large proportion of their housing stock was built before building codes (which includes energy efficiency) were introduced (Greece, Slovenia, Croatia, Spain, Poland, Italy, Cyprus) and therefore, tended to be hugely energy efficient.

In recent years the majority of Member States have introduced some kind of loan or grant scheme for the retrofit of buildings and installing energy efficiency measures. However, these appear to have been introduced primarily for the carbon savings that can be achieved and thus are often open to all, not specifically for low income groups (Greece, Croatia, Slovenia, France, Finland, Austria, Poland, Cyprus, Romania). In the case of Denmark, there was a scheme to exchange old oil boilers for natural gas boilers or heat pumps but for financial reasons this has now been discontinued. Equally Finland has now

discontinued its energy efficiency scheme. The only subsidies now available are for the elderly or disabled and are meant as improvements to help them stay in their homes which might mean the subsidies are used for energy efficiency or heating improvements.

In the case of some Member States these energy efficiency retrofit programmes were funded at a local level through municipalities as in the case of Lithuania. Barcelona for example, provides financial incentives for the renovation of properties and in the case of vulnerable consumers this can be up to 100% funding.

Other renovation programmes are focused more specifically on providing energy efficiency measures for the homes of more vulnerable consumers (Czech Republic), in Belgium there is a 'social renovation' grant for private dwellings on the rental market that are below a certain rental price. In the UK the government energy regulator administers the ECO scheme – a requirement upon energy companies to install energy efficiency measures to vulnerable households.

3.2.4 Information provision & raising awareness

Vulnerable consumers, whilst being one of the most important sectors of society for improving energy literacy are, paradoxically, one of the hardest to reach. Generally where there is a stronger recognition and movement to address energy poverty, there are more campaigns to raise awareness.

Transparent billing & price comparison: Often something that is driven nationally and by governments, several Member States have implemented policies to force utility companies to provide clear and transparent billing advice with clearly defined information on tariffs. The success of these policies seems somewhat varied; Croatia and Spain for example both indicate that whilst these policies are present there is significant room for improvement. Other countries such as Romania, UK and Netherlands appear to have had more success. In the UK, the government's energy regulator ensures that energy companies provide considerably more simplified bills with information on cheaper tariffs. The Netherlands, like the UK also provides considerable national and local energy information on price comparison and tariff switching.

Energy advice: what constitutes energy advice is an interesting area. The bullet points below are taken from the questionnaires - each respondent was asked whether they thought each bullet point represented energy advice...

- Raising general awareness of, and attracting attention to, the issues. e.g. items in the press/media; flyers; websites; contact with community and trade groups; targeted events
- Providing general information to explain the problems and relevant actions. e.g. leaflets; websites; factsheets; guidebooks

- Providing guidance on someone's specific situation and suggesting actions that could be taken. This requires some interaction with the client. e.g. Interaction with the client via telephone; interview; visit; advice stand; written reports with specific recommendation
- Activities to raise the level of knowledge, with a longer term perspective, not necessarily intending to achieve immediate action. e.g. inclusion in school curricula; professional or vocational training; community based adult education

The majority of Member States have some form of energy consumption information but whether it can all be considered advice is the question. At its most basic level, countries like Greece and Slovakia have humanitarian, voluntary groups and NGOs who are able to provide energy advice to vulnerable consumers but there are no public services. Others such as Finland, Spain, Denmark, Czech Republic, France and Italy provide energy advice perhaps through energy advice centres but more often a web-based service that may not necessarily be targeted at vulnerable consumers.

For other Member States advice can be much more targeted. Both Slovenia and Belgium provide an energy advice network with home energy advisors whose central role is to support vulnerable consumers. Similar initiatives take place in the UK - the BESN (Big Energy Saving Network) trains front-line workers to both spot energy poverty in the vulnerable consumers they work with but also to provide energy advice. In the Netherlands local support in terms of energy advice is given as part of a debt mediation programme whilst in Spain support appears to be given at a more regional level. A number of Spanish municipalities have been piloting a system called PAE (point of energy assistance), and in Barcelona this means the provision of 10 information points within the city. Any consumer is able to visit these information points for assistance; however vulnerable consumers can receive additional support for in terms of switching contracts, changing the terms of the contract or getting help to stop a disconnection. In Poland there is local support based on the welfare system, but it is not focused only on energy and energy poverty, however in a lot of municipalities, local government support vulnerable consumers and all of their energy efficiency action.

If we are looking to provide energy advice to vulnerable consumers we perhaps need to understand who our vulnerable consumers are.

When looking at vulnerable consumers the following factors need to be considered⁵

Consumer vulnerability across key markets in the EU 2016:

- Having difficulties choosing and accessing products and services is the most important driver of consumer vulnerability. Consumers who are not able to read terms and conditions due to small print, who do not know their contract conditions, who rarely compare deals from providers or who rarely read or thoroughly

⁵ http://ec.europa.eu/justice/newsroom/consumer-marketing/infographs/consumer-vulnerability/index_en.html

understand communication from their providers, are more likely to be vulnerable in some indicators compared to their peers.

- Both young and old age can be drivers of consumer vulnerability depending on the situation. Furthermore, consumers who are non-native speakers, female, poorly educated or who live in low-density regions are more likely to be vulnerable in some indicators compared to other consumers.
- Consumers in difficult financial situations are generally more likely to be vulnerable compared to other consumers. Furthermore, consumers who suffer a long-term sickness or disability are more likely to be vulnerable in some indicators, such as having limited capacity to maximise their well-being, compared to other consumers.
- Not using the internet overall, and not using the internet to search for information is associated with a higher likelihood of vulnerability in some indicators.
- Consumers who are considered as credulous, impulsive or risk averse and consumers who have poor computational skills or are less trusting of people in general are more likely than others to be vulnerable in certain indicators.

If we are looking at providing energy advice to vulnerable consumers, households that are at risk of or are already in energy poverty we need to recognise that many of the factors listed above will be barriers to providing effective advice and support. It is very possible that those most at risk will not have access to online information and therefore online only energy advice and switching services will not benefit them. Even written leaflets may be too complicated for them to work out or not provided in their own language. Many schemes and advice pathways are also dependent upon consumers organising support themselves either by completing forms or making phone calls both of which may be too difficult for the individuals to perform, thereby creating a hole in the safety net designed to help them.

The questionnaire circulated (Annex 2) asked whether the following interventions could be considered as giving energy advice:

- Raising general awareness of, and attracting attention to, the issues. e.g. items in the press/media; flyers; websites; contact with community and trade groups; targeted events.
- Providing general information to explain the problems and relevant actions. e.g. leaflets; websites; factsheets; guidebooks.
- Providing guidance on someone's specific situation and suggesting actions that could be taken. This requires some interaction with the client. e.g. Interaction with the client via telephone; interview; visit; advice stand; written reports with specific recommendation.

- Activities to raise the level of knowledge, with a longer term perspective, not necessarily intending to achieve immediate action. e.g. inclusion in school curricula; professional or vocational training; community based adult education

Interestingly, Portugal, Slovenia, Netherlands, Belgium and UK all felt that certainly the first 2 points could not be considered advice on the grounds that it is not targeted and does not necessarily reach or address the individual in need.

3.3 What are the similarities/differences across Member States with respect to recognition and definition of the issue, and policy measures implemented to address the issue?

*Energy poverty is an issue that is growing in both recognition and prevalence across Europe*⁶, nevertheless, how each Member State approaches tackling the issue vary widely and is dependent upon a number of issues.

The UK and Ireland have a long history of academic research looking at and tackling the issue of energy poverty. There are other Member States for whom there is a formal definition for energy poverty and where addressing it is integrated into either their national or regional policy such as Belgium, France and Cyprus. Equally there are Member States for whom there is no formal definition but for who it is an issue which is recognised and being addressed either nationally or more commonly at a regional level and often as part of a wider welfare programme, Netherlands and Spain.

Interestingly, in response to the questionnaire, some of the newer Member States from Central and Eastern Europe acknowledged that whilst energy poverty was still a relatively new concept, it was becoming an increasingly widely recognised issue and one that was starting to be addressed. The questionnaires indicated that the issue was predominantly down to old and inefficient housing stock that hadn't been maintained in recent years and had been constructed before building controls were introduced. They often have the added complication of district heating systems which do not allow individual dwellings to regulate the temperature or timings. Slovakia and Romania both have a formal definition for energy poverty, in Slovenia it is in the early stages of development, whilst in Poland there is no formal definition it does, however, informally use the World Health Organisation definition.

Lastly, there are a number of Member States for whom energy poverty not does appear to be an issue and is certainly not considered as outside of their existing welfare system, this

⁶ Rethinking the measurement of energy poverty in Europe: A critical analysis of indicators and data. Indoor & Built Environment, Vol 26(7), February 2017.

is particularly the case in the Scandinavian countries and Austria. Denmark does acknowledge that as an issue it can occur in rural areas where households do not have access to energy efficient heating, and as is true in many cases, those most at risk tend to be elderly. Nevertheless, it does not appear to be driving any policy change. Without talking to those who completed the questionnaires, it is difficult to fully ascertain why energy poverty is not a particularly big issue in these countries, however, from an outsider's perspective; the following points could be contributory factors:

- Build quality – northern European homes tend to be very well insulated.
- Higher standard of living with a more effective welfare system
- Comparatively lower cost of energy, particularly electricity, compared to income.

4 Summary of selected EU projects

4.1 The focus on vulnerable consumers and energy poverty - the way vulnerable consumers and energy poverty are addressed;

The addressing of the vulnerable consumers and energy poverty could be considered in terms of identification, basic focus of the undertaken actions and outcomes.

4.1.1 With regard of identification several approaches could be delineated:

The first approach - clearly linked to some of the action projects - addresses vulnerable consumers and energy poverty through existing national social policy and social assistance measures. The identification is policies-based and the assumption is that existing policy measures clearly identify the population of citizens who need support. As a result, vulnerable consumers are identified as those who already receive some support from social services and can therefore be reached through social workers. Strength of this approach is the clear focus on those users who are already identified by social services as being in need. This strong side is not to be underestimated as it undoubtedly will address a group of citizens in need (as a rule, smaller than those actually in need due to the fact that policy measures quite often are not particularly generous, including in terms of eligibility conditions). Another advantage is that this is the easiest and quickest way vulnerable and energy poor consumers to be reached, which could stimulate the effectiveness of the actions. Weaknesses of this approach are that: existing political identifications are accepted uncritically; attention is not paid to the depth of energy poverty; the scope of the target group and consequently the necessary impacts are reduced, etc.

A second approach is based on addressing all consumers, including among them the vulnerable ones and those living in energy poverty. Within this approach, segmentation of consumer models deserves serious consideration. A strong side is also that it creates opportunities to outline distances and to test hypotheses about different behavioural patterns and strategies. However, it seems that in such projects, vulnerable consumers and energy poverty largely remain a side and secondary issue not addressed with the necessary attention.

A third approach – most often related to research projects – tries to identify the scale, the causes and the consequences of energy poverty. Most often the energy poverty generators are identified as low level of incomes, high price levels and housing quality in ref. with energy efficiency. Wider frameworks addressing energy poverty are also in place and further elaborated – for example, the need for comprehensive coordination of many

existing policies and, respectively, actors in the field of energy poverty. Advantages of this approach include formulation of indicators and description of the situation of energy poverty and energy poor in the different EU countries. At the same time, the transformation of research results into political actions and interventions remains problematic, incl. due to the lack of sufficiently focused efforts in the field;

It seems important to note as well that:

- The review of the projects under consideration shows that clear focus on vulnerable consumers and energy poverty remains problematic above all due to the lack of a clear and accepted methodology for identifying and monitoring the vulnerable consumers and energy poverty. The absence of such a definition at European level, as well as the varied and even contradictory practices in the various EU Member States, results in the absence of a common approach to addressing them;
- Additionally, vulnerable consumers and energy poor are addressed as a target group subjected to the impact of the different interventions being implemented and the question of their involvement as 'experienced experts', including in decision making, is addressed rarely, if at all.

4.1.2 The different approaches outlined above reflect the different focus of the undertaken actions:

- Most of the reviewed projects have as a basic focus providing information and advising aiming at energy saving behaviour linked with the EU strategy for saving energy; (in more details this is discussed in the next points);
- Research projects focus on explanations of energy poverty drivers; elaboration of indicators; provide forecasts for future developments; try to contribute to the understanding of the complexity of the phenomenon.
- The accumulation of knowledge on energy poverty seems to be accompanied with some kind of imbalance in the actions and interventions targeting different energy poverty generators. More concretely (although not included into the reviewed projects), there are many projects in the field of energy efficiency of homes (while the question of how far these projects address those most in need remains open); At the same time there are fewer projects related to the low incomes as an energy poverty generator and there are almost no projects related to the rising energy prices. Thus especially the link of incomes and prices - that is the purchasing power - as an energy poverty generator remains largely unaddressed.

The undertaken actions and the way (vulnerable) consumers and energy poverty are addressed have resulted into many positive outcomes, as proposed by the different projects. They could be summarized in:

- Much better informed consumers, incl. vulnerable consumers and energy poor people;
- More developed qualifications of different stakeholders and capacity building
- Better knowledge on energy poverty and vulnerable consumers;
- More informed policy proposals

Still, the question to what extent this has contributed to the decrease of energy poverty remains open. Rather it could be suggested that the reviewed EU projects have generated important premises to work in this direction. However serious efforts are necessary to transform these premises into a real energy poverty reduction.

4.1.3 Trainings for energy information and advising – a review of the focus and approach

There is a growing development in the field of training. The reviewed projects depict the availability of a wide range of training materials developed for different groups. Many of these training materials are aimed at specialized trainings of intermediaries that can influence vulnerable consumers/ energy poor people as a target group. Energy advisers and ambassadors are trained among professionals, social workers, etc. There is also a trend toward professionalization of the activity - examples in this direction are the development of an accreditation system and various methodological guides. Another important positive is the search to recruit advisers/ambassadors from the target groups, as well as attempts to engage young and unemployed people.

There is considerable accumulated experience in ref. with the elaboration and implementation of different training materials and modules. They aim primarily at different stakeholders that mediate the relationship between energy suppliers and consumers. It may be useful to bring all these training modules together in order to be used in the future. For the time being, they are present on the web as part of the specific projects and sometimes disappear along with the completion of the project.

There is also a second type of training materials: - a set of guides aimed at (vulnerable) consumers, whose main purpose is to suggest ways to save energy in homes, This takes different forms: on the spot (related to home visits), by the web and/or through call centres – and presents activities for informing and advising.

Improvements of the informational flows and the better equipment of (vulnerable) consumers with knowledge on the processes (incl. with smart meters) are important premises for (vulnerable) consumers' empowerment. Still, in regard with empowerment much further steps seem very important. A necessary trend is to address vulnerable consumers and energy poor not just as target groups on which to act but as actors,

‘experienced experts’ in the field who could contribute to future development. In this regard a different type of trainings needs to evolve as well: for example, trainings to participate in decision taking mechanisms on energy poverty; trainings for civil participation capacity building; trainings in ref. with monitoring energy poverty generators; trainings for participatory assessments of the social impact, etc. All such activities, as far as they could be considered useful, also need training and training materials.

4.1.4 Established networks – a review of the focus and stakeholders

Networking is an integral part of almost all the EU projects under consideration: in fact, the reviewed projects have created and are based on some kind of networks. The range of these networks varies considerably - some are quite wide, others are quite narrow – just the partners. Still, there is a clear trend to try to engage different kinds of stakeholders – professionals, actors linked to the energy providers, social organizations, authorities at different levels (local, regional, national, EU), etc. Although, the sustainability of the created networks is not quite clear (if they act only at the time of the project or continue after that as well), it is certain that capacity has been built in that direction and that the results achieved could be useful, including by revitalizing networks created in the past.

The activities of the established networks follow the basic focus of the actions of the different reviewed EU projects. Additionally, it seems that in these networks, as a rule, consumers, especially vulnerable and energy poor consumers are seldom if at all involved. Most often these are networks of intermediary bodies, often focused on the concrete actions and not involving broader framework of activities.

The review suggests that additional added value can be sought from the established networks: for example better exchange between the different stakeholders on their field of interests; better feedback on visions and proposals, incl. from social workers and (vulnerable) consumers. Such developments could alleviate the current gap between energy and social stakeholders and contribute to better energy poverty reduction focus.

4.1.5 Enhancing energy saving behavioural change & strategies to involve consumers' engagement – types of actions and strategies;

In many of the reviewed (action) projects this is a central aspect - to stimulate energy savings. In this respect, the projects present data on the outcomes and report the extent to which energy saving behaviour is achieved.

However, as a rule, this covers different consumers, but does not clearly concern or relate to vulnerable and energy poor consumers. And some projects report opposite results in ref. with vulnerable consumers and energy poor – the information and advising could lead to increased use of energy. The reason for this is the fact that many of the vulnerable and energy poor consumers could have already reached the possible limits of minimum use of energy and therefore the focus on reducing energy costs by changing behaviour is not

well adapted to vulnerable consumers and energy poor people. For the same reason, projects targeting all users could hardly make significant contributions to vulnerable consumers and energy poor.

In fact, consumer behaviour research can in principle contribute to increased energy saving but it could have limited opportunities for energy poverty reduction.

At the same time, there could be opportunities to increase project efficiency and reduce energy poverty if research into consumer behaviour of vulnerable consumers and energy poor is deepened, including by identifying different groups among them and checking the energy poverty gap. Such a research could help to understand whether these groups of consumers could actually profit from energy behavioural changes or other types of measures to reduce energy poverty are needed. This is important in order to alleviate the risk some energy poverty reduction projects to adapt energy poor to the condition of the main factors of poverty, and thus to poverty itself, instead to seek changes in the factors and to mitigate poverty. In principle, it could be suggested that vulnerable consumers and energy poor people could hardly take advantage of energy saving and that there is some limit linked to energy saving rational behaviour and to the ability to cut costs to get out of the state of energy poverty. However, this may not apply to all groups of vulnerable consumers and energy poor.

Additionally, the experience in energy saving behavioural changes accumulated by different EU projects could be very useful to contribute to the necessary assessments of minimum thresholds for energy and thus to support the process of elaborating methodologies for adequate minimum income schemes.

4.1.6 Typologies of policy proposals for a better protection of vulnerable consumers & against energy poverty - types of areas and focus of policy proposals;

There are a wide variety of policy recommendations proposed in the different EU projects under consideration. Most of the reviewed EU projects include directly or indirectly some kind of recommendations usually in their sphere of activities and are often linked with visions for possible improvements in the undertaken activities. In summary these recommendations could be classified into several basic groups:

- Recommendations concerning improved information and advanced informative services for consumers: Many projects provide proposals and lessons learned how to better equip consumers with the necessary knowledge for their everyday consumption patterns and to better follow the information from the energy providers. These recommendations are linked as well to proposals for higher attention to qualified trainings in the field and building capacity in networks;
- Recommendations for a specific focus on vulnerable consumers and better understanding of energy poverty concept in its complexity: “A common

understanding of the concept of energy poverty will help MS. States, civil society and industry to start a dialogue about energy poverty and how to tackle it.”; “Need to establish energy poverty as an issue that demands tailor-made policies and measures at local, national, and EU level.”; “A consistent diagnosis”;

- Recommendations concerning careful monitoring of developments and their impact on energy poverty: “First, EU policies to consider the differential impact that the on-going global economic and Euro area crisis is having on welfare levels across member states, with a particular emphasis on the effect of austerity measures; Second, efforts to liberalize and privatize the EU’s energy sector need to take into account domestic energy affordability and access criteria, & of the energy poverty risks that the transition to a low-carbon EU poses in terms of increasingly higher energy prices.”; “Decision makers should pay ample attention to equity aspect of the expected future price increase that will affect certain households more severely and could widen the existing “energy gap” and inequality among households.”

4.1.7 Summary

Summarizing, the review of the selected EU projects depicts clear gaps as far as energy poverty reduction is concerned (between researches and interventions; social and energy stakeholders; consumer protection measures and measures aimed to adapt behaviour; informing and empowering consumers, etc.). However the review suggests as well many different opportunities to fill in these gaps on the basis of accumulated experience.

5 Annex 1 - Database on Reviewed EU Projects

5.1 Action Projects

Acronym & Project Title	Start/end date:	Internet address	Countries involved	Summary
ACHIEVE - “Actions in low income Households to Improve energy efficiency through Visits and Energy diagnosis”	2011-2014	http://www.geres.eu/en/achieving-acting-in-low-income-households#fiche-technique	Germany, Bulgaria, France, UK, Slovenia	ACHIEVE aims to help Europeans to reduce energy poverty by practical and structural solutions. By analysing and learning from best practises throughout Europe, it developed a mixture of actions plans and practical solutions to identify those in most need in specific areas, evaluate options and reduce energy poverty and carbon emissions. Home visits to households that have difficulties in affording basic energy needs were intended to analyse with the households their energy and water consumption, and identify the everyday actions that can have a real impact to reduce it. Visits also provided an opportunity for the household to install small energy efficient and water-saving equipment. The project offers for the households support and motivation towards a better management of their energy use and bills. ACHIEVE partners also identified complementary structural measures at the building scale, and supported householders to address these. The project is supported by Intelligent Energy Europe. Overall budget: 1.307.536,00 € (EU contribution: 75,00 %)
BECA - Balanced European Conservation Approach – ICT services for resource saving in social housing	01.2011 - 12.2013	http://www.beca-project.eu/home.html	Germany, Sweden, Spain, Italy, Czech Republic, Bulgaria, Serbia. Pilots of BECA services are located at 7 sites in 7 countries: Sweden (Örebro); Spain (Manresa); Germany (Darmstadt); Italy (Torino); Czech Rep. (Havírov); Bulgaria (Ruse); Serbia (Belgrade).	The Project addresses the need to substantially reduce the overall demand for energy and water across EU social housing. BECA develops a set of innovative services for resource use awareness and resource management, addressing energy & water and including all key energy forms - electricity, gas and heating. The project involves strong activities in Eastern Europe as well as in the North, South and West of the EU. Partners provide ICT-based energy management and energy awareness services directly to social housing tenants and service operators. Services address approx. 5,000 social housing tenants across 7 sites in 7 European countries; The aim is to achieve sustained reductions in resource use through usable ICT-based services directly to tenants, as well as by effective monitoring and control of local power generation and, for district heating, the full heat delivery chain. Intensive work addressed the need to optimise services for tenants and maximise impact on resource use behaviour; The project is partially funded under the ICT Policy Support Programme (ICT PSP) as part of the Competitiveness and Innovation Framework Programme by the European Community.
Citizens’ Energy Forum	Established by EC in 2007	European Commission website	EU member states	Aiming to improve the operation of retail markets in order to yield benefits for both electricity and gas consumers the European Commission established the Citizens' Energy Forum (also known as the London Forum) as a regulatory platform to help deliver competitive, energy efficient and fair retail markets for consumers; The Citizens' Energy

				Forum brings together national consumer organisations, industry representatives, national regulators and government authorities to work on key issues such as switching energy suppliers, user-friendly billing, smart metering, or protecting vulnerable groups. A special Vulnerable Consumer Working Group (VCWG) is established engaged with energy poverty and vulnerable consumers, invited to 'explore the potential for common approaches across the EU to vulnerability and energy poverty definitions and policies'. The VCWG works around two main objectives: (i) increasing transparency in the identification and measuring of consumer vulnerability and energy poverty; and (ii) providing targeted assistance to protect the most vulnerable and tackle energy poverty.
EC-LINC -Energy Check for Low Income Households	04.2011 - 02.2014	http://www.berliner-agentur.de/en/node/2518 https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/.../ec-linc www.changeworks.org.uk/.../Energy Check for Low Income https://www.gesobau.de/.../Projektbeschreibung_EC-Link_2012	Austria, Denmark, Germany, Hungary and UK	The project "Energy-Check for Low Income Households" (EC-LINC) established tailored information and consultation approaches to assist low income households in saving energy and water at home. No- and low-cost measures have been combined within an advice service that is especially designed to bring practical knowledge on energy efficiency and viable tips to households who may be in energy poverty. During the home visits, advice was provided on the efficient use of energy and water. Small devices such as compact fluorescent lamps (CFLs) and tap aerators were provided for free. Each household received an individual household report with a description of their potential savings and further tips for changing behaviour. Overall budget: 806.636,00 € (EU contribution: 75,00 %) More details: https://www.energiaklub.hu/files/study/energiaklub_poverty_or_fuel_poverty.pdf
EMPOWERING - Empowering customers to save energy by informative billing	04.2013 – 03.2016	www.iee-empowering.eu	Spain, Austria, France, Italy, Belgium	EMPOWERING aims at helping customers to save energy by positively manage their energy consumption. The project targets energy savings and increased customer satisfaction on a basis of more detailed information. It brings together 4 European energy utilities and an international team of university researchers, social scientists, local authorities and energy experts for developing and providing insight based services and online tools to encourage customers to save more energy. The informational services are: • comparison with similar households • indications of performance improvements over time; • consumption-weather dependence; • detailed consumption visualisation and breakdown; • personalised energy saving tips; • alerts (high consumption, high bill, extreme temperature, etc.)
EN2 - Energy Neighbourhoods2: The Energy Challenge	04.2011 - 10.2013	http://www.simpla-project.eu/media/47811/intelligent_energy_europe_-_energy_neighborhoods2_-_the_energy_challenge_-_2014-07-17.pdf	Germany, Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Poland, Slovenia, Sweden, UK, France, Spain, Romania, Hungary	EN2 was a successor of an earlier Energy Neighborhood project and built on the idea of an energy saving bet between cities and citizens. Cities challenged their citizens in two consecutive years to save at least 9% energy in 4 months compared to the previous year. The approach combined a competition on local, national and EU level with measures, such as training for households and municipalities, consumption monitoring and local climate campaigns. Throughout the process, knowledge was provided to all participating households and information events were organised. Participating households were supported by specially trained "Energy Masters" - volunteers from the neighborhood that motivated, supervised monitoring and provided materials. Local authorities were supported by the partners to implement the project. The project's main results are considered to

				be reduced energy consumption in private households and raised awareness for energy efficient products and climate protection policies.
ENERGY AMBASSADORS “Campaign to fight against fuel poverty and raise awareness on energy efficiency and energy savings”	05.2009 – 10.2011	http://spme.ro/en/nd/63/energy-ambassadors-and8211-campaign-to-fight-against-fuel-poverty-and-raise-awareness-on-energy-efficiency-and-energy-savings ; https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/energy-ambassadors	France, Denmark, UK, Sweden, Greece, Italy, Romania, Bulgaria, Spain	Dealing with energy issues in a context of social difficulties the project looks for solutions for the concerned people to save money and energy, and to gain other benefits as comfort and health improvement. The Main objectives of the project are: 1/ To implement sustainable and practical solutions to fight against energy poverty and generate energy savings in households; 2/ To duplicate and adapt the French Energy Ambassadors concept: phone advices, home visits, trainings, conferences; 3/ To aware and inform our final target group on energy savings and to achieve behavior changes; 4/ To train professionals working with this public on energy savings and energy efficiency; 5/ To enable an exchange of knowledge and experience among the Energy Ambassadors and the Consortium partners; 6/ To transfer, replicate and sustain the Energy Ambassadors Campaigns in other regions and other social organizations.
FIESTA - Family Intelligent Energy Saving Targeted Action	10.2014-09.2017	http://www.fiesta-audit.eu/en/ ; https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/fiesta	Italy, Spain, Croatia, Bulgaria, Cyprus	FIESTA aims to lead families with children to save energy at home, acting both on their energy consumption behaviour and on their purchasing decisions. As the need for cooling is a growing issue to be faced urgently, the project focuses on cooling and heating solutions which offer significant domestic saving potential. With the support of 20 partners (6 technical partners and 14 municipalities), FIESTA involves 5 countries with a Mediterranean climate that require extensive use of air conditioning systems. Energy Help Desks are established in the municipalities providing support and door to door energy audits for families. Specific actions towards schools, social housing residents, heating and cooling retailers and installers are envisaged. To attract additional beneficiaries, several FIESTA lotteries are organized and consumers’ purchasing groups are created to foster families’ investments. In particular the main results achieved are the following: 1.300 audits performed; 27 workshops for social housing residents organized; 173 workshops for schools done; 15 workshops for retailers and installers of heating and cooling systems organized; 10 FIESTA prize giving ceremonies; 10 Consumer purchasing groups established.
REACH – Reduce Energy use And Change Habits	03.2014 - 02.2017	http://reach-energy.eu/	Bulgaria, Croatia, Macedonia, Slovenia	The aim of REACH is to contribute to fuel poverty abatement at practical and structural level, to empower energy poor households (vulnerable consumers) to take actions to save energy and change their habits, and to establish energy poverty as an issue that demands structural solutions (tailor-made policies and measures) at local, national and EU level. Promotion campaigns for visits to energy poor households were implemented together with local actors in 5 pilot areas. After conduction of visits and provision of energy saving toolkits and advices to energy poor households, the results were evaluated and recommendations were addressed to decision makers. Target groups: energy poor households; local actors that can help address energy poverty; local, national & EU level decision makers.
SMART-UP– Vulnerable consumer empowerment	03.2015 – 02.2018	https://www.smartup-project.eu/	France, Italy, Spain, UK, Malta	An European project exploring opportunities to fight the economic and social phenomenon of the "energetic poverty" (energy poverty). The overarching aim of SMART-UP is to encourage the active use of Smart Meters

in a smart meter world				and In-House Displays by vulnerable customers in those Member States where the roll-out of Smart Meters has been embarked upon.
SERENADE - Sharing Expertise in Energy Advice across Europe	01.2006 – 02.2008	https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/serenade	UK, Austria, Bulgaria, France, Italy, Slovenia, Sweden	The SERENADE project brings together several experienced advice providers to: Study and review existing advice provision in Europe; Make know-how on delivering advice easily available through an online energy advice toolkit and forum for exchange of knowledge and experience between skilled practitioners and new providers; Deliver a pro-active dissemination programme to promote the benefits of advice and the resources available. In terms of advice subject matter, the project is concerned with energy efficiency, renewable energy and sustainable transportation/mobility. Three client groups are considered: households, small and medium enterprises and local authorities. The project has three elements: a study of the provision of energy advice in Europe; an online energy advice toolkit; a programme of dissemination to reach stakeholders across the Community, to promote the benefits of good quality energy advice and the availability of resources to help both new and existing providers, including an online energy advice forum. It is intended that this will form the basis for a thematic network.
TRIME - Trias Mores Energetica	09.2014 – 08.2017	https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/trime	UK, France, the Netherlands, Spain, Belgium	The project focus is on residents of social housing as a distinct group of consumers. The project tries to engage residents to empower and motivate them to save energy, facilitating an active change in their consumption and purchasing behaviour. Behaviour change amongst residents is achieved in 2 ways: 1) Energy consumption is addressed by developing 60 trained Energy Ambassadors to encourage the residents to save energy, and create a multiplier among the chosen consumer group; 2) Changing purchasing behaviour through enabling residents to purchase low cost, low energy using appliances. This is achieved through developing business models that provide for the sale of refurbished appliances, the rental of appliances and the manufacturing of new energy efficient appliances that are low cost to buy. TRIME also aims to achieve a change in the purchasing behaviour of social housing companies by a mobilisation of investment of €20 million in sustainable energy by EU stakeholders.

5.2 Research Projects

Acronym & Project Title	Start/end date:	Internet address	Countries involved	Summary
Energy Poverty Handbook (office of Tamasz Meszerics, MEP)	Publication: October 2016, Brussels	http://meszerics.eu/pdf/energypovertyhandbook-online.pdf	EU wide	Articles presenting research results of studies of energy poverty, its cause, consequences and approaches and instruments to alleviate it.
Energy poverty in the European Union: landscapes of vulnerability	Author: Stefan Bouzarovsky; Paper, August 2013	-	EU wide	Review of debates and academic research of energy poverty; identification of groups, places and spaces vulnerable to a lack of adequate energy services in the home.
EVALUATE - Energy Vulnerability and Urban Transitions in Europe	03.2013 - 02.2017	https://urban-energy.org/evaluate/	The project involves a comparative study of eight urban districts within four ECE cities: Gdańsk (Poland), Prague (Czech Republic), Budapest (Hungary) and Skopje (Republic of Macedonia).	EVALUATE is a five-year European Research Council funded project, underway since March 2013. It aims to investigate the character, prevalence and evolution of energy poverty in European cities. It uses a vulnerability framework to study energy poverty, meaning that the project's emphasis is on the risk factors that may make a given household, community, city or country susceptible to energy poverty.
EVENT - Energy Vulnerability and Alternative Economies in Northern Greece	07.2013 – 08.2014	https://urban-energy.org/event/	UK & Greece	The project tries to push the boundaries of existing knowledge about the driving forces of energy poverty in Europe, by investigating the social, economic and spatial underpinnings of this condition through an energy vulnerability lens. Energy vulnerability is seen as the propensity of a household to lack a socially- and materially-necessitated level of energy services in the home. EVENT was based in Greece, a country which has recently experienced the rapid expansion of energy poverty, incl. in the midincome strata. As a result of the economic crisis, the unravelling of corporate-led forms of universal energy provision has been accompanied by the emergence of new household practices in this country's informal economy. The project explains the socio-technical production of energy poverty in Greece and Europe more generally; develops an explanatory framework for the driving forces of energy vulnerability, incorporating dimensions such as energy affordability, energy efficiency, access to infrastructure, features of the housing stock, as well as household energy needs and practices; considers assets and alternative economic practices used by vulnerable households.

EPEE “European fuel Poverty and Energy Efficiency”	12.2006 – 10.2009	https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/epee ; http://www.precarite-energetique.org/	Belgium, France, Italy, Spain, UK	The EPEE project led to the following main results: An analysis of energy poverty situations in the different partners’ Country; An analysis of the current policies to address energy poverty and to identify best practices.
EPOV - European Energy Poverty Observatory	12.2016 – 03.2020	http://fuelpoverty.eu/about/epov/	UK as an administrator of the website, all countries participate with information	The project aims to develop a new European Energy Poverty Observatory (EPOV). The EPOV project is scheduled to last 40 months, and is implemented by a pan-European consortium of 13 organisations, including universities, advocacy groups, think tanks, and the business sector. The University of Manchester leads the consortium. The overarching aim of the EPOV is to engender transformational change in the availability of information about the socio-economic extent of energy poverty in Europe, and measures to combat it.
EMIN 1 – European Minimum Income Network	2013-2014	https://emin-eu.net/	All EU countries + Norway, Iceland, Serbia, Macedonia	The European Minimum Income Network (EMIN) is an informal Network of organisations and individuals committed to achieve the progressive realisation of the right to adequate, accessible and enabling Minimum Income Schemes. EMIN unites various experts, professionals, academics and diverse entities active in the fight against poverty and social exclusion. EMIN is organised at EU and national levels, in all the Member States of the European Union and also in Iceland, Norway, Macedonia (FYROM) and Serbia. It aims to build consensus and take the necessary steps towards the progressive realisation of adequate and accessible minimum income schemes in EU Member States. EMIN1 includes review of the minimum income schemes in all involved countries, incl. social assistance for energy poverty.
INSIGHT-E - “An Energy think tank informing the European Commission”	2014 - 02.2017	http://www.insightenergy.org/	UK, Germany, Belgium, France, Italy, Croatia, Ireland, Netherlands, Sweden	INSIGHT_E provides decision makers from the European Commission with unbiased policy advice and insights on policy options, including an assessment of their potential impact. Moreover, it brings to the attention of policy makers new trends in technology as well as the objectives and activities of important stakeholders that have a key voice in European energy policy-making. The INSIGHT_E consortium is comprised of a multidisciplinary team of experts, representing various sectors: academia, research centres, consultancies, one think tank, one stakeholder organization and one of the Knowledge and Innovation Community of the European Institute of Technology. They are experienced in delivering high quality policy advice and have access to a large network of stakeholders.

NATCONSUMERS - NATural Language energy for Promoting CONSUMER Sustainable Behaviour	05. 2015 – 06.2017	http://natconsumers.eu/	Hungary, UK, Italy, Spain, Norway, Finland, Greece, Belgium	The NATCONSUMERS project aims to address the EU need in the Europe 2020 strategy for reduction of the primary energy use by 20% by 2020, as well as the 20% of greenhouse emission, by proposing integral measures and activities that promote energy saving in domestic area. Starting point: Most energy efficiency measures implemented in Europe involve technological interventions. In spite some of them were successful many of them failed due to low user engagement and participation since they were ignoring the different factors affecting user behaviour. NATCONSUMERS promotes energy saving in domestic area through raising consumer awareness on energy as a daily life concerns, and provoking direct actions by making consumption visible and summarising it into tailored tips for energy consumption.
Good Practices Aiming to End Energy Poverty (office of Tamasz Meszerics, MEP)	Publication: 2016 Brussels	http://meszerics.eu/pdf/energypoverty-goodpractices.pdf	Good practices from different EU and Europe	A collection of good practices, created as a side project of the Energy Poverty Handbook. The booklet presents projects delivering large scale physical interventions, offering energy advice, smart metering or financial support for energy poor households and finally bottom-up projects which actively involve the concerned households. Each case study provides an overview of the projects (and contacts with the leaderorganisation), presents the results and discusses lessons learnt through the projects. Success factors and elements of sustainability are also reviewed. The case studies are collected by Anna Bajomi (trainee, office of Tamás Meszerics MEP) and Viola Shanini (trainee, EAPN).

5.3 Mixed/Other Projects

Acronym & Project Title	Start/ end date:	Internet address	Countries involved	Summary
ENACT – Energy Auditors Competences, Training and Profiles	09.2014 – 08. 2016	http://www.enactplus.eu/eng ; http://www.aisfor.it/progetti-24-enact	Italy, Portugal, Poland, Spain	ENACT aims to contribute to the definition and implementation of a common frame of the green professional qualification and competences of Energy Auditors (according to the European Directive 2010/31/EU - EPBD recast), defining the skills and professional profile at European level of an expert on energy issues and to meet the Article 17 on the independent experts. This is a research project to analyse the legislation and the situation in the various European countries concerning professional figures in the sector of energy auditing, basing on comparative analysis, to define common competences of an European figure.
ENFORCE project: European Network for the Energy Performance Certification of Building	09.2009 – 08.2012	http://www.buildup.eu/en/explore/links/enforce-project-european-network-energy-performance-certification-buildings ; https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/enforce	Italy, Portugal, Spain, Slovenia, Greece	The ENFORCE project intends to give final consumers independent, qualified, information and assistance on energy certification of their buildings, allowing them to make informed decisions, thus aiding the diffusion of energy certification (Energy Performance of Buildings Directive 2002/91/EC); It tackles obstacles to intelligent patterns of energy use by: carrying out 6 national studies on the steps and experience in introducing new legislation, plus a European comparative study on replicable best-practice; creating a trans-national network of trained energy auditors, operating under a common code of conduct, to assist final consumers on energy performance related topics; operating a call-center for consumers as a first contact point, providing the requested information and access to the network of auditors; launching an information campaign to promote the call-center and network services, thus qualify the market.
FINSH - Financial and Support Instruments for Fuel Poverty in Social Housing	01.12.2007 – 31.05.2010	The website of the project has expired; https://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/finsh	France, Germany, Italy, Poland, UK	The aim of the project FinSH was to develop relevant support schemes to address financial and social barriers to access to energy efficiency retrofitting in social housing. It contributed to the reduction of energy poverty and to the increase of energy saving in social housing in Europe. One key feature of the project is to combine financial, social and energy approaches. The project includes both analysis of financial products to foster energy efficiency retrofitting and development of practical support guidelines to increase the access to these financial products for energy-poor households and social housing companies. This could aid organisations throughout Europe working with social housing tenants who are at risk of energy poverty, to encourage them participate to energy efficiency programmes and measures. The project works closely with banks, energy and social experts and with relevant current EU and national initiatives.

DOMINO - Connecting Europe, Saving Energy	03.2016 – 10.2018	https://www.dominoenergy.eu/en/project	Germany, Italy, Belgium, Bulgaria	An EU project within the framework of the Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme. "The goal of the DOMINO Challenge is to promote awareness of private electricity consumption and, at the same time, to spread knowledge of simple yet effective energy-saving measures that contribute to increased energy efficiency and real savings for households. Alongside the direct influence on the energy consumption patterns of the participating households, DOMINO will also generate research data. This data will be evaluated after the energy-saving game comes to an end, with recommendations for action to be passed along to politicians and policy-makers."
SPIRIT - Energising Faith Communities	03.2014 – 11.2016	http://www.spirit-project.eu/	UK, Ireland, Italy, France, Austria, Sweden, Czech Republic, Belgium	A partnership has been established and a standard methodology has been tested for the delivery of energy saving behaviour change campaigns via faith based networks that is applicable on a pan-European basis. Seven of the project partners undertook an average of 105 domestic demonstration energy assessments and advice sessions (led by professional advisers) in the homes of members of faith based networks – 734 in total. Each of the partners trained an average of 58 members of the faith based networks with which they were engaged to become volunteer energy champions – 405 volunteers in total, trained through 61 sessions. Once the volunteers were trained, the partners provided ongoing management, administration and support functions that assisted them in undertaking a total of 4,714 domestic energy advice sessions for other members of their faith networks
Step_by_Step - Step by step commitments for energy saving	03.2015 – 02.2018	http://cordis.europa.eu/result/rcn/195138_en.html	Italy, Belgium, Germany, Poland, Spain	Step by Step aims at reducing energy consumption of households and encouraging to invest in energy efficient products and/or high quality renewable energy products. This is done by provoking behavioral change through intensive accompaniment of participating households.

PROMISE - Promoting best practices to support energy efficient consumer behaviour on European islands	Italy, Denmark, Iceland, Greece, Spain, UK	http://ec.europa.eu/energy/intelligent/projects/en/projects/promise#lesson	Italy, Denmark, Iceland, Greece, Spain, UK	By sharing information and experience, energy agencies from Samso (Denmark), Iceland, Rhodes (Greece) and Tenerife (Spain) aimed to promote tried-and tested methods for reducing the energy consumption of households. Knowledge has been transferred through capacity building workshops, EASWs (European Awareness Scenario Workshops) and awareness raising campaigns accomplished in each target island, i.e. Iceland, Rhodes, Tenerife. Each awareness campaign addressed targeted groups of island households, included at least 35 home energy checks in each target island and made use of energy efficiency tools developed throughout the project. Public authorities, both local and national, have been involved and policy recommendations with concrete action lines have been elaborated that favour energy efficient consumer behaviour. A European awareness campaign disseminated project achievements to a wide network of islands and involved six new islands as so-called 'island buddies' in the project.
USMARTCONSUMER - You are a Smart Consumer	03.2014 – 02.2017	http://www.usmartconsumer.eu/	United Kingdom, Poland, Austria, Italy, Germany, Poland, Netherlands	The project is aimed at enhancing European households (tenants and owners) based on the improved information facilities of their smart meter, informing and involving them in the innovative services that help them save electric, gas or district heating energy and get user-friendly interfaces. The project focuses on Member States where energy savings are an issue in the national business case for smart meters. By now information services that can be provided to consumers start emerging in the market. The aim is to help create the right market conditions and help send targeted information to consumers in the partner countries. The project focuses on concrete actions from households to generate estimable impacts in terms of savings. During the action, the needs of vulnerable consumers will get special attention.

6 Annex 2 - Partner Countries: Research Questionnaire Template



1. Who is completing this questionnaire?

Partner name:	
Are you referring to a whole country or a region with a country?	
Name of region/country:	
Questionnaire completed by:	
Job title:	
Email:	
Date of completion:	

2. Background to the Region

Population: <i>(is this regional or national?)</i>	
What is the balance between rural and urban areas?	
What are the main urban centres?	
What is the demographic profile?	
What is the ethnic profile?	
Describe the range of languages spoken	
Please briefly provide details of any issues related to the population profile that need to be considered when planning to tackle energy/fuel poverty and vulnerable consumers?	

--

3. The economy and its structure

What is the state of the economy and how has this changed over the last few years?
Please comment on employment and the security of employment within your country.
Please briefly comment on any issues relating to employment in general, or with different groups, that could affect consumer vulnerability and energy/fuel poverty.

4. Housing construction and ownership

What is the proportion of owner-occupied housing compared to private and socially rented property?
Describe the make-up of housing (e.g. <i>multi-apartment blocks/terraced etc</i>)
Please comment on the energy efficiency ratings of properties in your country (e.g. <i>Are there variations between EPC ratings and housing tenure or region?</i>)
Briefly comment on any relevant issues in your region related to housing construction and ownership.

--

5. Regional Variations

Do you have clear economic variations within your region/country? <i>For example: between rural and urban areas or a North-South divide?</i>
Yes / No
If 'yes', please briefly describe and explain the pattern.

6. Fuel and Energy Poverty

Refer to list of energy poverty definitions in Appendix 1 . Is there a definition for the country concerned?
Yes / No
If 'yes', is the definition still the same as the definition provided? If 'no', has a definition since been developed? If so, please record the new definition below.
If there is no formal definition, what does your organisation consider fuel/energy poverty to be? Please comment on how rigidly you adopt this term.
Do you recognise any difference between the terms 'fuel poverty' and 'energy poverty'? If yes, please specify.

7. Key contributors to energy/fuel poverty

In your view, what do you consider to be the main contributors to energy/fuel poverty in your country?

8. Smart-metering

What is the current situation regarding smart-metering in your country?
e.g. percentage roll-out, training etc

9. National and local buy-in to energy efficiency

Briefly describe how committed you believe that the government (on a national and local scale) are committed to energy efficiency, renewables and combating energy/fuel poverty? *Usually, the greater the commitment, the more effective the measures.*

10. Actively identifying vulnerable consumers

Do you use the welfare system as a way to actively identify (not define) vulnerable consumers?

Yes / No

If 'yes', please let us know anything else you do in addition to using the welfare system to identify vulnerable consumers.

If 'no', please let us know how you actively identify vulnerable consumers?

11. Measures to address energy poverty

a) Which of the following measures are available nationally and/or locally?

Measure	Scale	Comments
Financial interventions providing short-term protection for vulnerable consumers	national/local only	
Additional consumer protection measures which focus on vulnerable consumer protection, and are dominated by disconnection protection	national/local only	
Energy efficiency measures , particularly those focusing on building retrofit (especially those targeted at vulnerable consumers)	national/local only	
Information provision , including measures relating to price comparison and transparent billing.	national/local only	
Domestic support , is there a person/place where vulnerable consumers may request specific energy advice?	national/local only	

- b) The measures below have been identified as 'likely to have a positive impact' on potentially vulnerable consumers. Please tell us which measures are in place in your country.

Measure	Present on a national scale (0 = Not present, 5 = highly integrated)	Present on a local scale (0 = Not present, 5 = highly integrated)
Well targeted support measures in the energy-sector that address fuel poverty among vulnerable consumers		
Measure	Present on a national scale (0 = Not present, 5 = highly integrated)	Present on a local scale (0 = Not present, 5 = highly integrated)
Additional measures to alleviate or mitigate financial pressures on individuals and households		
Measures addressing marketing practices that exploit consumers' vulnerable situations		
Information is accessible to non-native speakers		
Measures to help young people overcome the feeling of being unassertive or problems with comparing deals		
Measures to help older people overcome problems of choosing and accessing deals		
Measures to address issues with complex, misleading or difficult to understand information and provision of simple, clear, transparent and comprehensive information		
Awareness-raising campaigns about energy related comparison tools and existing market conditions		
Measures to improve access to,		

knowledge of, and confidence in the online environment		
Measure to improve the physical accessibility of public and private commercial buildings and potentially redefining discriminatory treatment		
Measures assisting consumers who are totally or largely confined to their home		

Additional comments:

12. Energy Advice

a) Which of the following do you consider to be advice?

Measure	Advice?
Raising general awareness of, and attracting attention to, the issues. <i>e.g. items in the press/media; flyers; websites; contact with community and trade groups; targeted events</i>	Yes / No
Providing general information to explain the problems and relevant actions. <i>e.g. leaflets; websites; factsheets; guidebooks</i>	Yes / No
Providing guidance on someone's specific situation and suggesting actions that could be taken. This requires some interaction with the client. <i>e.g. Interaction with the client via telephone; interview; visit; advice stand; written reports with specific recommendation</i>	Yes / No
Activities to raise the level of knowledge, with a longer term perspective, not necessarily intending to achieve immediate action. <i>e.g. inclusion in school curricula;</i>	Yes / No

<i>professional or vocational training; community based adult education</i>	
---	--

- b) Please refer to the Serenade Advice Grid and Summary shown in [Appendix 2](#) (below) showing advice that was offered in each member state in the 2007 report.

Referring to the details provided in Serenade, have the details changed?
Yes / No
If 'yes', please provide details of the changes.

Thank you for your time.

Please pass all completed forms to victoriab2@severnwye.org.uk

Deadline: Friday 15th September 2017

Summary of energy advice programmes for households by country

Key to topic abbreviations: RES = renewables energy sources; RUE = rational use of energy (energy efficiency); SMO = sustainable mobility/transportation

Country	Programme	Type	Delivery agent	Area	Topics	Impartial	Free to user	Set up
Austria	Different in each region	Various	Mix	Patchy	RES, RUE	Mostly	Some services	
		Phone, mail, home visit, sessions in public buildings	ESV (regional energy agency)	Upper Austria	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	1991
Belgium	Guichets de l'énergie	Interview at centre, home visit, public events, phone, mail, e-mail.	12 local advice centres	Wallonie & Brussels regions	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	1985
	Guichet de l'énergie	Energy advice counter, energy audits, advice on renovation and restoration	Brussels Energy Agency	Brussels region	RES, RUE	yes	yes	1985
Bulgaria	National Information Centre	Drop in centre, info and some advice	Bulgarian Energy Efficiency Agency	Sofia city	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	
	EBRD & Kozluduj funds for measures	Advice linked to installation of measures and obtaining funding	Suppliers, installers, banks, utilities	all	RES & RUE equipment	No	Yes	
Czech Republic	EKIS CEA	Phone, mail, e-mail, interview at centre, home visit, public events	Czech Energy Agency through local centres	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	1995
Denmark	Energijtenesten	Phone, mail, e-mail, some drop-in centres	13 regional energy service centres	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	2005
Estonia	ESK Kredex		Energy Efficiency Consulting Centre (ESK)	all	Buildings RUE	Yes	Yes	2005
France	Espaces Info Energie	Phone, mail, home visit and other direct advice.	ADEME, through independent local centres	all	RES, RUE, SMO	Yes	Yes	2001
Germany	Energy hotline	Phone	DENA (national energy agency)	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	2001
	Energy advice as part of range of consumer advice services	Advice at consumer centres or on site	Verbraucherzentrale Bundesverband (German Consumer Organisation)	all	RES, RUE	yes	small fee	1978
	BAFA (within Ministry Economy & Technology)	On site technical advice for owners of older buildings	Consultant advisers and engineers	all	RES, RUE, funding	yes	yes	
	CO2 online	Online 'heating check'	CO2 online	all	RUE	yes	yes	2005

Hungary	Energy efficiency Advisory Network	Advice interview at centre by appointment	Environmental NGOs run energy advice centres	all	RUE	Yes	Yes	1999
Ireland	Renewable Energy Information Office and other programmes	Info mainly through website, promotional events and written materials. Home advice to vulnerable within Warmer Homes programme.	Sustainable Energy Ireland (national energy agency)	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	
Italy	CCEI (Centro di Consulenza Energetica Integrata)	Advice at drop-in centres, projects, energy audits, energy planning	ENEA, National Energy Agency	11 towns	RES, RUE	Yes	yes	
	Consumers' Information Desk	Phone, post and e-mail, from one central office, 3 days/week	Adiconsum: Consumers' Association	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	
	Advice from utilities - various	Advice desks, exhibition centres, websites	Utilities required to give advice under 2001 legislation	all	RES, RUE	(yes)	yes	
Latvia	Energy Efficiency Centre	Advice at centre, training, electricity costs calculator	Latvenergo (state owned energy supplier)	Riga	Efficient use of electricity	No	Yes	
Lithuania	ENA	Audits, awareness campaigns, information materials	ENA (State Energy Agency)	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes	
Luxembourg	Reidener Energiatelier	Advice in office, site visits, telephone, e-mail	ASBL Reidener	16 communities	RES, RUE	yes	yes	2006
Malta	MEEREA	Info and awareness only	MEEREA: Malta Energy Efficiency & Renewable Energy Association	all	RES, RUE	Yes	Yes, to members	2001
Netherlands	Milieu Centraal	Info website plus some phone, e-mail and mail advice and loan of meters.	Milieu Centraal	all	Range of environmental issues	yes	yes	1997
	Eco-driving	Awareness, info, phone advice, training	Senternovem	all	SMO	yes	yes	

7 Annex 3 - Wider European Countries: Research Questionnaire Template



1. Who is involved in this questionnaire?

Country conducting:	
Partner conducting:	
Name and role of interviewer:	
Email of interviewer:	
Date of interview:	
Country being interviewed:	
Name of organisation being interviewed:	
Name and role of interviewee:	
Email of interviewee:	

2. Role of the company

Please can you briefly describe the role of your organisation and how it links to energy/fuel poverty and vulnerable consumers:
Is your organisation private/public/not-for-profit?
What area does your organisation cover? <i>For example, national, regional etc. Name the region if it is not national.</i>

--

3. Housing construction and ownership

What is the proportion of owner-occupied housing compared to private and socially rented property?
Describe the make-up of housing (e.g. multi-apartment blocks/terraced etc)
Please comment on the energy efficiency ratings of properties in your country (e.g. Are there variations between EPC ratings and housing tenure or region?)
Briefly comment on any relevant issues in your region related to housing construction and ownership.

4. Fuel and Energy Poverty

Interviewer to refer to list of energy poverty definitions in Appendix 1 (below). Is there a definition for the country concerned?
Yes / No
If 'yes', is the definition still the same as the definition provided? If 'no', has a definition since been developed? If so, please record the new definition below.
If there is no formal definition, what does your organisation consider fuel/energy poverty to be? Please comment on how rigidly you adopt this term.

Do you recognise any difference between the terms 'fuel poverty' and 'energy poverty'? If yes, please specify.

5. Smart-metering

What is the current situation regarding smart-metering in your country?
e.g. percentage roll-out, training etc

6. Actively identifying vulnerable consumers

Do you use the welfare system as a way to actively identify (not define) vulnerable consumers?

Yes / No

If 'yes', please let us know anything else you do in addition to using the welfare system to identify vulnerable consumers.

If 'no', please let us know how you actively identify vulnerable consumers?

7. Measures to address energy poverty

c) Which of the following measures are available nationally and/or locally?

Measure	Scale	Comments
---------	-------	----------

Financial interventions providing short-term protection for vulnerable consumers	national/local only	
Additional consumer protection measures which focus on vulnerable consumer protection, and are dominated by disconnection protection	national/local only	
Energy efficiency measures , particularly those focusing on building retrofit (especially those targeted at vulnerable consumers)	national/local only	
Information provision , including measures relating to price comparison and transparent billing.	national/local only	
Domestic support , is there a person/place where vulnerable consumers may request specific energy advice?	national/local only	

Additional comments:

8. Energy Advice

c) Which of the following do you consider to be advice?

Measure	Advice?
Raising general awareness of, and attracting attention to, the issues. <i>e.g. items in the press/media; flyers; websites; contact with community and trade groups; targeted events</i>	Yes / No
Providing general information to explain the problems and relevant actions. <i>e.g. leaflets; websites; factsheets; guidebooks</i>	Yes / No
Providing guidance on someone's specific situation and suggesting actions that could be taken. This requires	Yes / No

some interaction with the client. <i>e.g. Interaction with the client via telephone; interview; visit; advice stand; written reports with specific recommendation</i>	
Activities to raise the level of knowledge, with a longer term perspective, not necessarily intending to achieve immediate action. <i>e.g. inclusion in school curricula; professional or vocational training; community based adult education</i>	Yes / No

d) Interviewers, please refer to the Serenade Advice Grid shown in [Appendix 2](#) showing advice that was offered in each member state in the 2007 report.

Referring to the details provided in Serenade, have the details changed?
Yes / No
If 'yes', please provide details of the changes.

Thank you for your time.

Please pass all completed forms to victoriab2@severnwyre.org.uk

Deadline: Friday 28th September 2017

Appendix 1:

Member State definitions of energy and fuel poverty (Insight E -Table 6)



Member State	Energy / fuel poverty definition	Definition metric	Status
Austria	Households are considered at risk of energy poverty if their income is below the at-risk-of-poverty threshold and they simultaneously have to spend an above-average percentage of their household income on energy.	Proposal to use multiple indicators: household income, housing expenses, energy costs; information about past due bills, disconnections, installations of pre-paid meters, etc.; subjective indicators, such as permanent household financial difficulties.	Unofficial definition under consideration
Cyprus	Energy poverty may relate to the situation of customers who may be in a difficult position because of their low income as indicated by their tax statements in conjunction with their professional status, marital status and specific health conditions and therefore, are unable to respond to the costs for the reasonable needs of the supply of electricity, as these costs represent a significant proportion of their disposable income.	Share of income spent on energy	Official definition
France	<i>Definition according to article 11 of the "Grenelle II" law from 12 July 2010:</i> Is considered in a situation of energy poverty "a person who encounters in his/her accommodation particular difficulties to have enough energy supply to satisfy his/her elementary needs, this being due to the inadequacy of resources or housing conditions."	A quantitative threshold is missing.	As a result of no quantitative threshold, the definition is not sufficiently operational.

Member State	Energy / fuel poverty definition	Definition metric	Status
Ireland	Energy poverty is a situation whereby a household is unable to attain an acceptable level of energy services (including heating, lighting, etc) in the home due to an inability to meet these requirements at an affordable cost.	Spends more than 10% of its disposable income on energy services in the home.	Official national definition
Italy	A family is vulnerable when more than 5% of income is spent for electricity and 10% for gas.	As stated in the definition – spending 5% of income on electricity and 10% on gas	Unofficial definition proposed by regulator.
Malta	Energy poverty: inability to achieve a necessary level of energy services in a household. Fuel poverty: mainly linked to inability to achieve the necessary level of fuel use for heating homes (i.e., if the household were to spend on the necessary fuel, then it would fall below the poverty line).	Currently only using the EU-SILC indicator for share of population unable to keep the home adequately warm. Proposals to include subjective feedback from consumers through household budgetary surveys and compare energy consumption across sectors.	These are unofficial definitions proposed by NGO.
Slovakia	Energy poverty is defined as a condition when average monthly household expenditures for the consumption of electricity, gas and heat, represent a significant share of the average monthly household income.	<p>According to the Concept for the protection of consumers fulfilling conditions of energy poverty, issued by the Regulatory Office, the Statistical Office provides information on average monthly household expenditure for energy consumption and household income. A household can be considered as energy poor if disposable monthly income is lower than the minimum monthly disposable household income threshold.</p> <p>The threshold is published on the website of the Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Family of the Slovak Republic, the Regulatory Office for Network Industries and on message boards of labour, social affairs and families, municipalities and municipal authorities.</p>	The threshold is currently a proposal.

Member State	Energy / fuel poverty definition	Definition metric	Status
UK (England)	A household to be fuel poor if i) their income is below the poverty line (taking into account energy costs); and ii) their energy costs are higher than is typical for their household type (DECC 2013).	Low income, high consumption (LIHC). Two criteria include i) fuel costs are above the median level, and ii) residual income net of fuel cost spend is below the official poverty line. This applies in England, while other constituent countries use the 10% threshold metric. Note that England continues to report the 10% threshold metric for comparison, which is that <i>a fuel poor household is one which needs to spend more than 10% of its income on all fuel use to heat it home to an adequate standard of warmth (21°C in living room, and 18°C in other rooms as recommended by WHO.</i>	Official national definition. Proposed target <i>to ensure that as many fuel poor homes as is reasonably practicable achieve a minimum energy efficiency standard of Band C, by 2030</i> (DECC 2014b).
UK (Scotland)	A household is in fuel poverty if, in order to maintain a satisfactory heating regime, it would be required to spend more than 10% of its income (including Housing Benefit or Income Support for Mortgage Interest) on all household fuel use (Scottish Executive 2002).	The definition of a 'satisfactory heating regime' as per for Wales (below)	Official national definition. Target is that as far as reasonably practicable, fuel poverty will be eradicated by 2016.
UK (Wales)	Fuel poverty is defined as having to spend more than 10 per cent of income (including housing benefit) on all household fuel use to maintain a satisfactory heating regime. Where expenditure on all household fuel exceeds 20 per cent of income, households are defined as being in severe fuel poverty (Welsh Assembly Government 2010).	As stated. The definition of a 'satisfactory heating regime' recommended by the World Health Organisation is 23°C in the living room and 18°C in other rooms, to be achieved for 16 hours in every 24 for households with older people or people with disabilities or chronic illness and 21°C in the living room and 18°C in other rooms for a period of nine hours in every 24 (or 16 in 24 over the weekend) for other households.	Official national definition. Target is that as far as reasonably practicable, fuel poverty will be eradicated amongst vulnerable households by 2010, in social housing by 2012 and by 2018, there would be no-one in Wales living in fuel poverty.
UK (Northern Ireland)	A household is in fuel poverty if, in order to maintain an acceptable level of temperature throughout the home, the occupants would have to spend more than 10% of their income on all household fuel use (DSDNI 2011).	'Acceptable' level as per WHO 'satisfactory heating regime'	Official national definition.



www.assist2gether.eu



This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 754051